

**Public Document Pack**  
**MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th  
August, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)  
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: A. Davies, D. Dovey, D. Evans, M. Feakins,  
R. Harris, J. Higginson, P. Murphy, M. Powell and A. Webb

County Councillor A. Easson attended the meeting by invitation of  
the Chair.

County Councillor A. Webb left the meeting following determination of application  
DM/2019/00564 and did not return.

County Councillor D. Dovey left the meeting during consideration of application  
DM/2019/00548.

**OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| Mark Hand                | Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping |
| Philip Thomas            | Development Services Manager                |
| Craig O'Connor           | Development Management Area Team Manager    |
| Andrew Jones             | Development Management Area Team Manager    |
| Joanne Chase             | Solicitor                                   |
| Denzil – John Turbervill | Commercial Solicitor                        |
| Richard Williams         | Democratic Services Officer                 |

**APOLOGIES:**

County Councillors: L. Brown and G. Howard

**1. Declarations of Interest**

County Councillor A. Davies declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the  
Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/00595 as he is a friend of  
an objector to the application. He therefore left the meeting taking no part in the  
discussion or voting thereon.

County Councillor D. Dovey declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the  
Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DC/2013/01071 as he had been  
involved with the plot in a previous career. He therefore left the meeting taking no part in  
the discussion or voting thereon.

County Councillor R. Edwards declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to  
the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/00593 as she is in  
partnership with the applicant. She therefore left the meeting taking no part in the  
discussion or voting thereon.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

County Councillor D. Evans declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/00595 as he is a member of Monmouthshire Housing Association Committee and also a Monmouthshire Housing Association tenant. He therefore left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

County Councillor P. Murphy declared a personal interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/00595 as he knows the family next door. He has also previously served on the Caerwent Community Council with the Monmouthshire Housing Association Board. He left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

County Councillor A. Webb declared a personal interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/00595 as she is a Member of Monmouthshire Housing Association. She therefore left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

#### **2. DM/2019/00595 - Change of use from a C3 dwelling house to C4 house in multiple occupation at 62 Chepstow Road, Caldicot**

Application DM/2019/00595 could not be considered at today's meeting due to the Planning Committee being inquorate for this application.

The application will be considered at a future meeting of the Planning Committee.

#### **3. Confirmation of Minutes**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 2<sup>nd</sup> July 2019 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

#### **4. DC-2013-01071 - Proposed commercial development comprising two A1 retail units (Retail Unit 1 (668.90 sq. m gross) Retail Unit 2 (594.58 sq. m gross) both to be occupied by a bulky goods retailer A1 retail) and a Class A3 public house/restaurant with ancillary accommodation, associated car parking, servicing, access and landscaping at Dixton Road, Monmouth**

We considered the report of the application which was presented for refusal for the three reasons as outlined in the report.

Councillor R. Roden, representing Monmouth Town Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points in objection to the application:

- The 2017 – 2020 Monmouthshire Destination Management Plan sets out the County's objectives. One of these objectives is to make a great first impression for visitors to Wales.
- Visitors should be encouraged to visit Monmouth to experience the unique blend of shopping, historical sites, restaurants and public houses that the town offers.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

- The construction of a prominent public house and retail park at the entrance to the town would be detrimental to the area, taking visitors away from the town and reducing footfall there.
- The proposed development would bring no benefit to the Town.
- The site is an unsuitable location for a development as outlined in the application.
- The second objective in the 2017 – 2020 Monmouthshire Destination Management Plan is to promote our inspirational landscapes and border country heritage that gives the County a special character.
- The proposed development is not in keeping with the area which is nearly surrounded by green fields and viewed from the Wye Valley Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB).
- On the English side of the border, the AONB extends further either side of the River Wye offering significantly more protection against damage to the area.
- The proposed development would be damaging to the scenic attractiveness of the area.
- Monmouth Town Council considers that the proposed development would damage the town and the surrounding area having a detrimental impact on tourism, the local economy, the environment and local residents.
- Stakeholder groups within the town are opposed to the proposed development. Monmouth Town Council asked that the Planning Committee considers refusing the application without reservation.

Mr. D. Cummings, representing Monmouth Chamber of Commerce, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points in objection to the application:

- The proposed development would adversely affect Monmouth as a market town and the Gateway to Wales.
- Confidence in the retail sector is fragile and there are currently 20 empty retail premises located within the Town.
- Small businesses not only face Brexit uncertainty but also a loss of business rate relief next year. The application adds to the local uncertainty.
- The proposal suggests that the lack of bulk goods retailers in Monmouth means that people are travelling to shop in Newport and beyond. It is considered that if residents cannot find goods in Monmouth then residents tend to buy goods online.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

- The objections to the application from Natural Resources Wales (NRW) is damning in its comments about the developer's failure to address fundamental issues about the flood consequence assessment and providing an escape route in the event of extreme flooding.
- Expert advice taken indicated that these objections are insurmountable.
- NRW is able to influence Welsh Government with a view to calling in any application it objects to.
- The Dixton site flooded extensively in 2014 and has flooded on occasions before 2014.
- Concern was expressed whether the operators of the site will be able to secure insurance if the land floods and if it does so repeatedly, concern was expressed that the site might be abandoned.
- The town's public house sector is already under threat with two closures occurring since the retail impact assessment was undertaken.
- The proposed site is located on the edge of the Wye Valley AONB and is at the entrance to the lower Wye Valley.
- Monmouth is the centre for education and retains many features from its historical past. It has a long musical heritage creating its uniqueness. No town has ever had its uniqueness improved by an out of town retail development.
- Monmouth Town Council fully supports the recommendation outlined in the report that the application be refused.  
Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2013/01071 be refused for the three reasons, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                 |   |    |
|-----------------|---|----|
| For refusal     | - | 10 |
| Against refusal | - | 0  |
| Abstentions     | - | 0  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2013/01071 be refused for the three reasons, as outlined in the report.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th  
August, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

**5. DM/2019/00280 - Demolition of existing house, detached garage and outbuilding and construction of two detached houses, Thorneycroft, Narth Road, The Narth, Monmouth**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Ms. S. Goodlass, representing objectors to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The proposal contains aspect that objectors believe are contrary to the following planning policies: Sustainable drainage (LDP Policy SD4 and TAN 15), affordable Housing and the development in minor villages' policies, Place making and design and the Policy LC4 Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. There are also a number of paragraphs outlined in the Local Development Plan (LDP) that are affected.
- There is no sustainable drainage system plan. Though not in a flood zone, Planning Committee is able to consider areas where third parties may adversely be affected by any increased risk of flood or runoff.
- There are a number of objections to the application indicating that residents have concerns about the drainage levels in that area. The report does not contain any conditions regarding SuDS preparation before a decision is made in respect of the appropriateness of the development in the location.
- Paragraph 1.4 of the report refers to car parking for a further two dwellings. Residents do not understand this.
- There are a number of plans that are listed in the report with some inconsistencies. Therefore, there should be a clear, accurate and consistent set of plans available before a decision is made in respect of the application.
- It had been identified that the frontages of the properties are similar to those in the local area. The frontages of three nearby properties include integral garages. However, the proposed properties do not.
- The footprint, rather than the width of the properties, was originally mentioned in the design and access statement. However, local residents consider that the proposed dwelling footprints are double those of their immediate neighbours.
- The landscaping, as outlined in the report, is significant mitigation to all of the villagers concerns about size, scale and visual impact of the development. Residents are concerned that although condition 8 might be placed on the planning conditions, there is very little residents are able to do regarding enforcing the planning conditions.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

- TAN 10 states that the Planning Committee is able to propose Tree Preservation Orders (TPOs) to protect and secure any trees or vegetation that is planted to fulfil conditions.
- Concern was raised regarding an access road through the development leading to a potential future development in a nearby field, which is a candidate site in the LDP.
- Residents requested that a condition be added preventing access through the development to the candidate site or that the decision should be deferred until the new LDP is published.

Mr. E. Pardington, the applicant's agent, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- With regard to drainage, there is no evidence to suggest that the development will flood.
- A comprehensive sustainable urban drainage scheme has been prepared and submitted to the Authority.
- The SuDS scheme is based on site and the site will be suitable for soakaway surface drainage.
- Treated effluent from septic tanks would be via conventional drainage field.
- All paved areas within the development are proposed to be permeable and will be self draining.
- With regard to conditions suggested by objectors in connection with drainage, no condition is required as SuDS approval is a separate application process and no development is possible on the site until that has been approved.
- With regard to the size of the dwellings and the frontages, the Narth is made up of and derives its character from having a mixture of styles and sizes some of which are larger than the proposed development.
- The existing buildings at the site have a footprint of approximately 180 sq. metres. The replacement of a single dwelling with two houses will usually result in a significant increase in footprint.
- The applicant is developing the site as a commercial venture. However, the commercial viability of the project is not yet certain. In order to maximise the potential market value of the proposed houses it has been necessary to maximise their size.
- The dwellings have a ridge height of 50mm lower than the adjacent property.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

- This is an area where sub-urban buildings should not be built. Integral garages are indicative of sub urban development.
- The applicant values the trees and feels that they are an integral part of the value of the site. The applicant would not object to a condition being added that the existing trees be retained. The trees that are proposed will be conditioned as part of the landscaping proposal.
- With regard to Highways access and visibility, the road is within a 60 mph speed limit. However, coming from the village, the alignment of the road restricts the speed of traffic and has been taken into account by the Highways Department. The Highways Department supports approval of the application.
- The applicant has no interest in the land to the rear of the site.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The southern boundary is closed off with planting terminating at the end of the site.
- There are no specific tree preservation orders on site. However, those that have been identified for removal have been considered by the Authority's Tree Officer who is satisfied with the net gain of planting of a variety of trees on the site.
- The site is a substantial plot that will comfortably accommodate two additional properties which will remain in keeping with the surrounding area.
- Ensure a detail of the eaves is submitted and included as approved drawing with a minimum of 150mm eaves over hangs.

It was proposed by County Councillor P Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DM/2019/00280 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 11 |
| Against approval | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 0  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00280 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th  
August, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

**6. DM/2019/00564 The erection of a new two storey detached dwelling, with associated parking and landscaping on land adjacent to Treff Garne, Chapel Lane, Pwllmeyric, Chepstow**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

Councillor G. Down, representing Mathern Community Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- This is a very narrow lane and there would be additional traffic generated should the application be approved. Pedestrians have to be mindful of the narrowness when sharing the lane with vehicles.
- Any additional traffic would conflict with any active travel plan for this location.
- The proposed property will be closer to the lane than any other property in this location.
- Since the proposed development will be positioned at a higher level than the lane, it will be a dominating feature.
- Access to the proposed property will require a tight turn through the entrance. Larger vehicles might not be able to gain access in a forward gear.
- Diagrams shown dealt with the street scene to the north. However, nothing was shown referring to properties in the south in Orchid Meadow. This is sloping ground, therefore, the proposed property will be on a higher level than those in Orchid Meadow creating an overbearing presence.
- This is a very large site. The site plan does not show the extent of the land within the property. There is further land which is excluded from the plan to the north west. Therefore, the proposed development could be located elsewhere within the site.
- Mathern Community Council asked that the Planning Committee considers refusing the application.

Dr. R. Collins, representing objectors to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Objectors refute the claims in paragraph 6.4.1 of the report that most of the comments made by the community council and local residents have been addressed. Objectors stand by their objections to the application.
- The history of the development at Treff Garne is important. The house was erected with no planning permission and the building height exceeded the



## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

building height of the house it replaced. Planning permission had been granted retrospectively. However, neighbours had not been given the opportunity to object to the raised roofline and the overlooking windows. It is an unwelcome precedent to be using this height and this building to set the height of the new proposed building.

- Paragraph 6.1.2 of the report states that there is sufficient space to accommodate a detached dwelling and associated amenity space on the site. However, the objectors disagree. The report acknowledges that the plot is smaller than those around it.
- 30% of the site will be needed for vehicular circulation.
- The proposed development will be close to the original house, site frontage and neighbouring boundaries.
- The congested development will not be in keeping with the established context of Orchid Meadow and Chapel Lane.
- The proposed development will not add to a sense of place as indicated in the report. The proposal does not comply with planning policy DES 1 of the LDP.
- Paragraph 6.1.3 of the report states that properties to the south of the development are at a slightly lower level than the new plot. The difference in level is significant which will result in a significant loss of privacy for existing dwellings. The proposed development will have a negative impact on existing local residents' privacy and amenity, contrary to planning policy.
- An earlier planning application for a development at Broadwinds in 2009 had been refused on the ground that the building would dominate adjacent buildings and would set a precedent. The same reasons apply to application DM/2019/00564 and therefore this application should be refused.

The local Member for Shirenewton, also a Planning Committee Member, was unable to attend the meeting but had emailed the Planning Department outlining her views on the application. The email had been presented to the Planning Committee in late correspondence. However, the Chair allowed a member of the Committee to read out the email, as follows:

'The application has generated both neighbourhood and community council strong objections due to it being an overdevelopment of the site, loss of the character of Chapel Lane with neighbourhood privacy concerns.

The character of Chapel Lane neighbouring properties in this area are distinctive in terms of being based on single dwellings in good size plots adjoining a narrow one way country lane, opposite the Mathern conservation area. The additional 2 storey dwelling set forward and close to the road in the front garden of the existing property will totally change and be detrimental to the character of the area and neighbouring properties,

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

and also will be detrimental to the visual amenity and the character of the existing dwelling.

It is important to note that the land slopes upwards so that the proposed new dwelling even though only 2 storeys will have a much greater impact on the privacy, visual and residential amenity of the properties lower down in Orchid Meadow due to the land being much higher. It means that quoting heights of the proposed dwelling and distances from neighbouring properties is irrelevant to the overbearing nature of the proposed dwelling due to the height of land differentials.

The planning report states that there is not a common building line but it is clear from the layout plan, that there is a common building line on the neighbouring properties of Chapel Lane, each with their own frontage.

In terms of planning policies, the proposed development is contrary to both planning policies EP1 and DES1 which can be found at the front ,on page 6 of this electronic version of this agenda. The major importance of these particular planning policy is illustrated by the fact that they are headed as the main policy context.

EP1 on Amenity states that: *Development including proposals for new buildings and advertisements, should have regard to the privacy, amenity and health of occupiers of neighbouring properties.*

In this case, this application does not have regard to the privacy of occupiers of neighbouring properties lower down in Orchid Meadow.

DES1 on General Design Considerations says as follows

*All development should be of a high quality sustainable design and respect the local character and distinctiveness of Monmouthshire's historic and natural environment.*

*Development proposals will be required to:*

*b) contribute to sense of place whilst ensuring that the amount of development and its intensity is compatible with existing uses;*

*c) respect the existing form, scale and siting , massing, materials and layout of its setting and neighbouring quality buildings;*

*d) maintain reasonable levels of privacy and amenity of occupiers of neighbouring properties where applicable;*

*l) ensure that existing residential areas characterised by high levels of privacy and spaciousness are protected from overdevelopment and insensitive or inappropriate infilling.*

<https://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk/app/uploads/2017/05/Adopted-Local-Development-Plan-with-PDF-tags.pdf>

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

The layout of the properties on the neighbouring Chapel Lane are characterised by high levels of privacy and spaciousness in relation to their layout, setting and neighbouring building on Chapel Lane and privacy levels, all being single dwelling plots with frontages. Whereas, in contrast, the proposed dwelling will result in 2 dwellings on one plot, with the additional dwelling in the front garden of the existing property. It would result in overdevelopment of the plot, impact on privacy and be completely out of character and detrimental to its neighbourhood and setting.

The planning report agrees in paragraph 6.1.2 that whilst there is a mixture of house types along Chapel Lane the prevailing character is one of modern dwellings occupying substantial plots. It is also the neighbouring properties prevailing character that these substantial plots are for one dwelling only.

In summary, in view of the strong objections from occupiers of neighbouring properties and it being contrary to the main planning policy context, particularly, but not only, ensuring that existing residential areas characterised by high levels of privacy and spaciousness are protected from overdevelopment and insensitive or inappropriate infilling. I would be grateful if the committee would support refusing this application on the grounds of policy EP1 and DES1 (paragraphs, B, C, D and L).'

In response to the local Member's comments, the Development Management Area Manager stated that the proposed development was in accordance with Policy DES1, EP1 and the site was sufficient to incorporate this development.

It was agreed that future statements in respect of a planning application made by Planning Committee Members and local Members who are unable to attend a Planning Committee meeting should be forwarded to the Planning Department to be placed in late correspondence. The letters would not be read out to the Committee, going forward.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- Concern was expressed that the proposed development would be dominant in the area.
- If the application is approved, it was requested that 5 metres of tarmac be incorporated where the driveway joins the highway.
- Concern was expressed that overdevelopment of the site could occur along the lines of the development near to the chapel where overdevelopment of this site has occurred.
- The proposed development complied with planning policy and there were no reasons to refuse the application.

The Development Management Area Manager stated that the Paddock is not a part of this application being considered today. With regard to reference made in respect of the five metres of tarmac to be incorporated where the driveway joins

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

the highway, it was noted that applicants are notified that this is a requirement via Section 184 of the Highways Act. However, with regard to this development it could be conditioned that the five metres of tarmac be incorporated. Planning policies DES1 and EP1 indicates that the plot is sufficient to accommodate this development.

It was proposed by County Councillor A. Davies and seconded by County Councillor D. Evans that application DM/2019/00564 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 legal agreement. Also, that an additional condition be added that the five metres of tarmac to be incorporated where the driveway joins the highway.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|
| For approval     | - | 6 |
| Against approval | - | 3 |
| Abstentions      | - | 2 |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00564 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 legal agreement. Also, that an additional condition be added that the five metres of tarmac be incorporated where the driveway joins the highway.

#### **7. DM/2018/01064 - Conversion of existing steel framed workshop to a multi-purpose venue for filming kitchen and small residential cookery school with additional use as a holiday accommodation. Workshop, Weir House, Llantilio Crossenny**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the nine conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application the proposed development would fit well within the site and will be an asset to the area.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DM/2018/01064 be approved subject to the nine conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 10 |
| Against approval | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 0  |

The proposition was carried.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

We resolved that application DM/2018/01064 be approved subject to the nine conditions, as outlined in the report.

#### **8. DM/2019/00413 - Retrospective planning application for existing garden play equipment. The Coach And Horses Inn, Caerwent**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the retrospective application, any noise generated would only be sporadic and would not be problematic. The business was focusing on providing for families and considered that the play equipment would enhance this provision. The conservation area is being preserved as part of this development.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor J. Higginson that application DM/2019/00413 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 10 |
| Against approval | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 0  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00413 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

#### **9. DM/2019/00548 - Extension to existing agricultural building. Change of use to equestrian centre for maximum of 16 horses with external manege. Latimer Farm, Earlswood Road, Earlswood**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Shirenewton, also a Planning Committee Member, was unable to attend the meeting but had emailed the Planning Department outlining her views on the application. The email had been presented to the Planning Committee in late correspondence. However, the Chair asked the Head of Planning, Housing and Place Shaping to summarise the email, as the Committee had already had site of the email in late correspondence.

The email is as follows:

'The relevance of the following comments read out at committee today may well be dependent on the site visit.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

The application is for change of use to an Equestrian centre for a maximum of 16 horses and the change of use and extension of an existing agricultural building.

#### 1. Siting of the Manure Heap

In this application the siting of a manure heap is a relevant factor for planning policy EP1 of the LDP, concerned with the residential amenity of any nearby residential property. I note that the manure heap for the equestrian establishment is well over 100m from the nearest residential property and pleased to see its location is conditioned. (See the end of the report and paragraph 6.1.3 of the committee report). However, the report does not mention which nearby residential property it is referring to or its actual distance. If it is the owner occupier's residence this is of course less of an issue as they can control its piling and spreading, provided the residence is not used in future by persons who are not also in charge of the Equestrian centre.

The condition at the end of this report refers to the location of the manure heap being based on drawing BP 2693/00 (July 2019). The dimensions of the manure heap are given as 3.6 x 4.5. However the drawing notes state that – *All dimensions must be checked on site and not scaled from this drawing.* The lack of measurements on the unscaled drawing itself for the location of the manure heap with reference to other points such as the building makes its actual location uncertain.

Members may recall a previous appeal application for another Equestrian centre (decision 3187660) which had a history of difficulty in enforcement due to its condition terms not being legally certain.

I would be grateful if on site and in committee members could also consider whether or not the manure heap is located as far away as possible from any residential property in the site. In an appeal application 124 metres was considered sufficient but this appears to be less than that distance, with the figure of well over 100 metres mentioned but no actual measurement.

The distance proposed here may be less than 124 metres to the nearest residential property, so should it be sited and conditioned to be further away and does it impact primary elevations and is there substantial screening to the nearest residential property? Questions which may have already been considered at the site meeting or remain outstanding.

Whilst NRW states that there is no legislation in relation to the manure heap not being located close to a soakaway, it does not seem to be a good idea. The general specifications are based on a manure heap being 10m from a watercourse and 50m from a well.

A government advice note states that *you must provide adequate storage for manure away from stable area:*

<https://www.gov.uk/guidance/keeping-horses-on-farms>

It is not clear what storage is here or what should be recommended as it is just shown as a square drawing on the plan?

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

Presumably the government advice may be due to the fact that large heaps of manure produce both a strong odour and flies which may be of concern to health for both horses so that it is stored away from the stable area and for any occupiers of nearby residential properties, particularly during the summer months if the prevailing wind is in the wrong direction.

It is surprising how much manure the average horse produces, estimated at 45lbs per horse per day, 51 stone per day for 16 horses or 9 tons per horse per year, resulting in an estimated 144 tons of horse manure per year for 16 horses.

<https://www.horseandhound.co.uk/news/defra-to-impose-muck-heap-fees-63473>  
[https://www.surreycc.gov.uk/\\_data/assets/pdf\\_file/0020/35336/ManureAdviceNote007.pdf](https://www.surreycc.gov.uk/_data/assets/pdf_file/0020/35336/ManureAdviceNote007.pdf)

#### 2. Landscaping

Please check on the siting of suitable landscaping in relation to removing the visibility of the manure heap/store from the landscape and from residential properties.

#### 3. Operation hours

I would be grateful if the committee could also consider whether or not they feel the operation hours are suitable.

In terms of operation hours, they are said to be from 6am to 21hours, which will generate extra traffic in a quiet country area with up to 16 vehicles accessing and exiting the site at different times of the day and night due to the 16 horses Please could the committee consider whether or not the opening hours from 7am to 21hours may be more reasonable and consideration being given to whether or not times should be adjusted to shorter hours in the winter months when it gets darker.

In summary, please could the committee give time and full consideration to the siting of the manure heap, landscaping and the opening hours of the equestrian centre for visual and residential amenity EP1 policy reasons and if this is not possible to deal with in time, to consider a deferral of this application even if just to ensure that the drawing location measurements are precisely defined to avoid any future condition wording and siting enforcement problems, in view of the history of enforcement problems in relation to a similar issue in decision 3187660.

I have also copied in members of the planning committee in view of the relevance to check on the site visit these issues, as well as for consideration at the committee.'

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor P. Clarke that application DM/2019/00548 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

|                  |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|
| For approval     | - | 9 |
| Against approval | - | 0 |
| Abstentions      | - | 0 |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00548 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

**10. DM/2019/00879 - Provision of pedestrian access to public car park and erection of fence and gate and associated works: The Inn Between, 53 Bridge Street, Usk**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, Monmouthshire County Council's Asset Management Team had been served notice of the application. Also, the fencing would be two metres high and the site was located within the Usk Conservation Area which would preserve the character of this area.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor D. Evans that application DM/2019/00879 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|
| For approval     | - | 9 |
| Against approval | - | 0 |
| Abstentions      | - | 0 |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00879 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

**11. DM/2019/00929 - Development proposal is for change of use from day centre to residential use at Boverton House Day Centre, Bulwark Road, Chepstow**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Clarke and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2019/00929 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.



## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th August, 2019 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|
| For approval     | - | 9 |
| Against approval | - | 0 |
| Abstentions      | - | 0 |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00929 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report and also subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

#### **12. DM/2019/01049 - Conversion of rear of existing MCC store and welfare building into a public toilet with disabled access at MCC Store and Welfare Building, Mill Street Close, Usk**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor P. Clarke that application DM/2019/01049 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|
| For approval     | - | 9 |
| Against approval | - | 0 |
| Abstentions      | - | 0 |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01049 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

#### **13. DM/2019/00593 - Storage barn for hay and straw. Whitehall Farm, Rockfield, Monmouth**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor J. Higginson that application DM/2019/00593 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |   |
|------------------|---|---|
| For approval     | - | 8 |
| Against approval | - | 0 |
| Abstentions      | - | 0 |

**MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 6th  
August, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00593 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

**The meeting ended at 4.20 pm.**